



Report Identification Number: BU-19-006

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Jul 02, 2019

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child’s family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child’s death; whether the child or the child’s family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child’s death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child’s death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child’s household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child’s siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS’ review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS’ assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult	
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPS-Child Protective Services		
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other	
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation		



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased
Age: 5 year(s)

Jurisdiction: Niagara
Gender: Female

Date of Death: 08/27/2012
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 02/06/2019

Presenting Information

An SCR report alleged that on 8/26/12, the grandmother went to sleep around 9 PM and left the 5-year-old female child alone with a neighborhood teenager who was an inappropriate caretaker. The grandmother was aware this teenager had a history of getting in fights and killing animals. While the child was unsupervised with the teenager, the teenager killed the child by beating her up, choking her, and throwing her down the stairs. The teenager then hid her body in a garbage can.

Executive Summary

This fatality report concerns the death of a female child that occurred in 2012; the child was 5 years old at the time. The child was in the care of her great-grandmother at the time of her death. The great-grandmother did not have any children in her care at the time the SCR report was made.

Niagara County Department of Social Services (NCDSS) contacted the source of the report, law enforcement, completed a CPS history check, and confirmed the medical examiner and district attorney were notified on 8/27/12. NCDSS obtained the child's death certificate which listed the cause of death was homicide and the manner was asphyxiation.

On 8/26/12, the child was staying with her great-grandmother while her mother worked. The parents were separated and the child was in the mother's custody at the time. Around 10 PM, the great-grandmother went to bed and allowed the child to color with a 16-year-old neighborhood boy, who had watched the child on 10 other occasions without incident. While the great-grandmother was asleep, the teenage boy murdered the child by choking her and then stuffed her body in an exterior garbage bin. The teenage boy confessed the crime to the police, but he could not explain why he spontaneously murdered the child. He was sentenced to 20 years to life in prison and remains incarcerated. The great-grandmother had no reasonable cause to suspect the teenage boy would cause harm to the child.

NCDSS interviewed the great-grandmother, father, and law enforcement. They obtained court documents and records from the medical examiner and police. NCDSS completed required reports and safety assessments accurately and on time and conducted a thorough investigation. The allegations of inadequate guardianship, DOA/Fatality, and lack of supervision against the great-grandmother for the child were unsubstantiated. The case was unfounded and closed on 4/10/19.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

- Safety assessment due at the time of determination? Yes

Determination:



- **Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?** Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- **Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?** Yes

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.

Explain:

The casework activity was commensurate with the case circumstances.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Date of Death: 08/27/2012

Time of Death: Unknown

Date of fatal incident, if different than date of death:

08/26/2012

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:

Unknown

County where fatality incident occurred:

Niagara

Was 911 or local emergency number called?

Unknown

Did EMS respond to the scene?

Unknown

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs?

No

Child's activity at time of incident:

Sleeping

Working

Driving / Vehicle occupant

Playing

Eating

Unknown

Other

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes

At time of incident supervisor was:

Drug Impaired

Absent

Alcohol Impaired

Asleep

Distracted

Impaired by illness

Impaired by disability

Other:

Total number of deaths at incident event:



Children ages 0-18: 1
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Female	4 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	42 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	No Role	Female	28 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Grandparent	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	62 Year(s)

LDSS Response

NCDSS initiated their investigation upon receipt of the SCR report and gathered information from news outlets regarding the death, as it occurred in 2012; the perpetrator was in prison serving a sentence of 20 years to life. There were no surviving siblings listed on the report.

On 2/7/19, CW made a home visit to the great-grandmother's home. The great-grandmother said she was caring for the child while the child's mother worked, which was typical. The great-grandmother said the teenage neighbor was a good, friendly kid who came around often and spent time with the child. She had no reason to suspect he was a danger to the child. The CW asked for contact information for the child's mother and the great-grandmother said she moved to Florida and had not spoken to her since the child's death; she had no contact information for her.

Notification letters were sent to all appropriate parties. The father called the CW upon receiving his letter. He said he did not want his children speaking to CPS; he had a son with his new partner, and his daughter was now an adult and believed to be living out of state. The father said that he suffered severe anxiety, depression and post-traumatic stress disorder from the death of his child. The father said he was in counseling and took medication. The CW offered the father further services and he declined.

The mother could not be located and her notification letter was sent to her last known address.

NCDSS received the death certificate for the child which listed the cause of death was homicide and the manner of death was asphyxiation-mechanical obstruction of airway and compression of the neck.

The father of the child filed a civil suit against the great-grandmother; this was dismissed as there was no evidence the great-grandmother had reason to believe the teenager would be a threat to the child. The Supreme Court's decision said the teenage neighbor had previously watched the child on more than 10 occasions without incident and there was "nothing to indicate a reasonable person could have foreseen the extraordinary inexplicable, and spontaneous homicidal violence that the teenage neighbor unleashed upon the child."

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Homicide

Primary Cause of Death: From an injury - external cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review



Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? Yes

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
050392 - Deceased Child, Female, 4 Yrs	050395 - Grandparent, Female, 62 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
050392 - Deceased Child, Female, 4 Yrs	050395 - Grandparent, Female, 62 Year(s)	Lack of Supervision	Unsubstantiated
050392 - Deceased Child, Female, 4 Yrs	050395 - Grandparent, Female, 62 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
--	-----	----	-----	---------------------



Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation?

Family Court

Criminal Court

Order of Protection

Criminal Charge: Murder **Degree:** 2

Date Charges Filed:	Against Whom?	Date of Disposition:	Disposition:
08/28/2012	A neighbor who was a teenager at the time	09/05/2013	Guilty
Comments:	The teenager was sentenced to 22 years to life in prison.		

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Family or others as safety resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? N/A

Explain:
Services were offered to the father but he already had counseling services in place and said he did not need any other services. The mother could not be located. The great-grandmother did not need any services.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

- Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? No
- Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? No
- Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No
- Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death? No

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There was no CPS history more than three years prior to the fatality.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There is no known CPS history outside of NYS.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Recommended Action(s)



Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No