

**Report Identification Number: NY-20-025** 

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

**Issue Date: Sep 03, 2020** 

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



# Abbreviations

Relationships						
BM-Biological Mother SM-Subject Mother SC-Subject Child						
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child				
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father				
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider				
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father				
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle				
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub				
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult					
	Contacts					
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner				
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services				
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother				
CPS-Child Protective Services						
	Allegations					
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts				
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding				
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse				
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect				
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive				
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision				
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other					
	Miscellaneous					
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender				
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence				
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police				
Service	Services	Department				
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care				
Rehabilitative Services	Families					
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services				
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan				
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment				
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old				
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur					



#### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** New York **Date of Death:** 03/04/2020

Age: 7 year(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 03/04/2020

#### **Presenting Information**

On 3/4/20, the SCR registered a report stating on 3/3/20 the father took the 7 yo SC to the hospital with a respiratory infection. The SC was treated and discharged hours later. On 3/4/20 at 7:00 A.M. the father found the SC unresponsive in his bedroom and rigor mortis had set in. The report stated the father called 911 and the SC was pronounced dead. The report further stated the SC was in the care of his parents. The role of the 6 yo sibling was unknown.

#### **Executive Summary**

The SC was seven years old when he died on 3/4/20. As of the writing of this report, the ME had not issued the autopsy report or provided a preliminary cause and manner of death.

The father was listed as the subject in one unfounded report involving a FC who did not reside in the home at the time of the SC's death.

The biological mother (BM) had an extensive history with ACS and the Bronx County Family Court (BxCFC). On 7/14/14, ACS filed an Article 10 Neglect Petition on behalf of the SC and his sibling, the BM was listed as the respondent. On 12/23/15, the BM's parental rights were terminated. On 2/15/17, the SC and his sibling were adopted by the former kinship foster father.

On 3/4/20, the SCR registered a report with allegations of DOA/FATL and IG of the SC by the BM and the father. According to the case documentation, the SC was born premature, had respiratory problems and was developmentally delayed which impaired his ability to communicate and interact. On 3/3/20, the SC was not feeling well, and the father took him to Mount Sinai Hospital (MSN) where he was treated and discharged hours later. It was recommended that the father give the SC his prescribed medication for the chest congestion. On 3/4/20, the father checked the SC and found him unresponsive. EMS was called, and the SC was transported to the hospital where he was pronounced dead.

ACS initiated the investigation timely and assessed the surviving sibling to be safe in the care of the father. The home was assessed to be appropriate and clean, and with provisions for the children. A full body check was conducted on the sibling and he was free of marks and bruises. ACS also learned that the BM visited and assisted with the care of the children on a regular basis. ACS observed the sibling was comfortable in the presence of the father and the BM.

ACS made relevant collateral contacts with the SC's and the sibling's school, and their medical providers. No one reported concerns about the father's or BM's ability to care for the children. ACS contacted the medical staff from the hospital and the ME, and there were no signs of trauma on the SC's body. The NYPD found no criminality involving the SC's death.

As of the writing of this report, ACS continued to reach out to the ME for the official cause and manner of death. Therefore, ACS had not made a determination.

## Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 3 of 10



### **Safety Assessment:**

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
  - **Approved Initial Safety Assessment?**

Yes

Safety assessment due at the time of determination?

Unable to Determine

Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment Yes appropriate?

#### **Determination:**

Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for The CPS report had not yet been all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?

determined at the time this Fatality report was issued.

Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate Unable to Determine appropriate?

### **Explain:**

The determination is pending.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

N/A

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant

Unable to Determine

statutory or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

Yes, the case record has detail of the

consultation.

#### **Explain:**

The level of casework activity, which includes contact with the family and others from the receipt of the report was commensurate with the case circumstances. The determination is pending.

#### **Required Actions Related to the Fatality**

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?  $\square$ Yes  $\bowtie$ No

## **Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities**

#### **Incident Information**

**Date of Death:** 03/04/2020 Time of Death: 07:20 AM

07:00 AM Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:

County where fatality incident occurred: New York

Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes

Time of Call: 07:00 AM

Did EMS respond to the scene? Yes

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 4 of 10



•	g to death, had child used alcohol or drugs	? N/A		
<ul><li>✓ Sleeping</li><li>✓ Playing</li></ul>	Incident:  ☐ Working ☐ Eating	☐ Driving / Vehicle occupant☐ Unknown		
How long before incident	Id's activity at time of incident:  Sleeping			
Γotal number of deaths at Children ages 0-18: 1	incident event:			

Adults: 0

## **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	7 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	32 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	27 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	6 Year(s)

#### **LDSS Response**

ACS initiated the investigation of the report by contacting first responders, medical staff and family members. The NYPD stated officers met with ME and there was no trauma or signs of maltreatment on the SC's body. Based on the information provided to the NYPD by the ME, it appeared the SC died of natural causes.

The detective stated the 911 call was made by the father at approximately 7:00 A.M. It was reported the SC was diagnosed with a chronic respiratory condition and had a lot of congestion in his nose and chest. According to the information reported by the father, he brought the SC to the ER on 3/3/20. The SC was treated for several hours and discharged in the evening. The father provided discharge papers which confirmed that the SC had in fact been treated on 3/3/20. The father said when he went to wake up the SC on 3/4/20, he found him unresponsive. The officer who was first on the scene arrived at 7:12 A.M and found the SC unresponsive.

ACS interviewed the father who reported the SC had been sick for two days prior to his death. The father stated that after the SC was diagnosed with lead poisoning, he began to sleep walk, have diarrhea, defecate on himself, and vomited frequently. The father said that on 3/3/20, he received a call from the SC's school nurse who reported the SC did not seem well. The father stated that he picked up the SC at 11:00 A.M., then stopped at McDonald's and the SC ate a cheeseburger and French fries. The father said the SC seemed happy and was running around, but his nose was still "running heavy." The mother said when they arrived at the home, the SC began to vomit and at about 3:15 P.M, they took him to the ER. The SC had a lot of mucus in his nose and was treated then discharged at 10:00 P.M. The father said he was concerned about the SC being discharged so soon because in the past whenever he took the SC to the hospital, they would admit him for several days. The father said they were given a suction for his nose.

The mother stated the SC was fed a can of chicken noodle soup which he threw up. The mother said she cleaned up the SC

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 5 of 10



and changed his shirt and then put him to sleep. The mother said the SC fell asleep at about 3:20 A.M.

On 3/4/20, the BM gave the SC his treatment in the living room at 4:00 A.M and then carried him back to his bed. The father said he got up at approximately 6:50 A.M to get the children ready for school, and found the SC was lying on the floor in between the children's beds. When he touched the SC, his body was stiff and there was mucus in the SC's nose. The father said he called 911 and the SC was transported to the hospital.

ACS spoke to the doctor who attended to the SC on 3/3/20 and learned the SC had fever, intermittently, for approximately five days prior to coming to the ER. The SC had a cough and rash on his chest. The doctor stated the decision to discharge the SC was due to the mother's account which noted the SC was able to eat and drink. The doctor stated several tests were conducted prior to the SC's discharged; however, by the time they received the results on 3/4/20, the SC had passed. The results revealed the SC had a cold. The doctor reported that she completed a chest x-ray and it was negative, his flu-test was negative, throat culture and rapid test was also completed.

ACS made relevant collateral contacts with the SC's and the sibling's school, and their medical providers. No one reported concerns about the father's or BM's ability to care for the children.

As of the writing of this report, ACS had not made a determination.

#### Official Manner and Cause of Death

**Official Manner:** Pending

**Primary Cause of Death:** Pending

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

#### Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? No

**Comments:** There was no documentation of an MDT response; however, the investigation adhered to previously

approved protocols for joint investigations.

#### Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

**Comments:** There is no OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team in the NYC region.

#### **SCR Fatality Report Summary**

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s) Allegation(s) Allega Outco		
053505 - Deceased Child, Male, 7 Year(s)	053507 - Father, Male, 32 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Pending
053505 - Deceased Child, Male, 7 Year(s)	053507 - Father, Male, 32 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending
053505 - Deceased Child, Male, 7 Year(s)	053509 - Mother, Female, 27 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Pending
053505 - Deceased Child, Male, 7 Year(s)	053509 - Mother, Female, 27 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Pending

#### **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 6 of 10



	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	$\boxtimes$			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	$\boxtimes$			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$			
Contact with source?	$\boxtimes$			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	$\boxtimes$			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	$\boxtimes$			
Did the investigation adhere to established protocols for a joint investigation?				
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	$\boxtimes$			
Fatality Safety Assessment Activities				
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,				
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to s household named in the report:	urviving	siblings/o	ther child	dren in the
Within 24 hours?	$\boxtimes$			
At 7 days?	$\boxtimes$			
At 30 days?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	$\boxtimes$			
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?		$\boxtimes$		
		I	I	<u> </u>
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious				
harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?				

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 7 of 10

Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile



				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate	in this case	?					
During the course of the investigation, we gathered to assess risk to all surviving si household?				$\boxtimes$			
Was there an adequate assessment of the	e family's n	eed for se	rvices?				
Did the protective factors in this case rec in Family Court at any time during or a	-		-				
Were appropriate/needed services offere	ed in this ca	ase					
Placement	Activities in	Response to	the Fatality	Investigatio	)n		
		response to		- I			
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the siblings/other children in the household care at any time during this fatality investigation.	be removed		0		$\boxtimes$		
Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality?							
Explain as necessary: N/A				-			
	Legal Activ	ity Related	to the Fatality	v			
Was there legal activity as a result of the			? There was		•		
Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailabl	e N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling			$\boxtimes$				
Economic support							
Funeral arrangements							
Housing assistance							
Mental health services							
Foster care							
Health care							
Legal services							

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 8 of 10

NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services
----------------------	--

			1	
Family planning			$\boxtimes$	
Homemaking Services			$\boxtimes$	
Parenting Skills			$\boxtimes$	
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>			$\boxtimes$	
Early Intervention			$\boxtimes$	
Alcohol/Substance abuse			$\boxtimes$	
Child Care			$\boxtimes$	
Intensive case management			$\boxtimes$	
Family or others as safety resources			$\boxtimes$	
Other			$\boxtimes$	

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality?  $N\!/\!A$ 

### **Explain:**

There were no immediate services needed to support the sibling's wellbeing.

## **History Prior to the Fatality**

#### **Child Information**

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?

Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?

Yes
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death?

Yes
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?

No

## **CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality**

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

## **CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality**

The mother had an extensive history involving the children listed in this report. The biological mother (BM) had an extensive history with ACS and the Bronx County Family Court (BxCFC). On 7/14/14, ACS filed an Article 10 Neglect Petition on behalf of the SC. On 12/23/15, the BM's parental rights were terminated. On 2/15/17, the SC and his sibling were adopted by the former kinship foster father.

#### **Known CPS History Outside of NYS**

There is no known CPS history outside of NYS.

NY-20-025 FINAL Page 9 of 10



## **Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality**

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? ☐Yes ☒No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? ☐Yes ☒No